The Development of the Pāli *Udāna* Collection

Bhikkhu Anālayo, PhD
(Privatdozent, University of Hamburg, Germany)

Abstract:

The aim of the present paper is to show that the Pāli *Udāna* collection is the product of a gradual development. The topics treated are: a comparison of the prose sections of the *Udāna* collection with one of its Chinese parallels (I); a survey of the thematic continuity (II) and the presence of concatenation (III) among the 'inspired utterances' collected in the *Udāna*; and an examination of the sequence of its prose narrations (IV).

Introduction

The Pāli canonical work entitled *Udāna* collects a series of 'inspired utterances' (*udāna*) by the Buddha in eight chapters (*vagga*) with ten discourses each. Throughout the Pāli *Udāna* collection, a prose narration provides information about what led to the inspired utterance in question.

The Pāli Udāna collection has a Sanskrit counterpart in the *Udāna (-varga)*[1], a work that collects over a thousand inspired utterances in thirty-three chapters.[2] Unlike the Pāli version, the Sanskrit collection does not employ prose sections to introduce or comment on its inspired

utterances. The same is the case for the *Udāna(-varga)* preserved in Tibetan translation.[3] In the Chinese canon two translations of an *Udāna* collection can be found.[4] While one of these also contains only verse, the other version (T 212/出曜經) accompanies its inspired utterances with prose sections.[5] According to a preface to this version, this *Udāna* collection was rendered into Chinese by Zhú Fó-niàn (竺佛念) based on an original read out to him by a Kashmiri monk, the translation being completed in the year 399.[6] This Chinese version (T 212) has nearly as many inspired utterances as the Sanskrit *Udāna(-varga)*,[7] which together with the prose section that accompany them cover thirty fascicles in the Taishō edition.

Ⅰ) The Pāli *Udāna* Collection in Comparative Perspective

Of the various extant parallel versions,[8] for the purpose of examining the Pāli *Udāna* collection this Chinese version (T 212/出曜經) is of central relevance, as it is the only canonical version that stands a chance of having not only counterparts to the inspired utterances themselves,[9] but also parallels to the prose narrations found in the Pāli *Udāna* collection. In what follows, I will survey parallelisms and differences between the prose materials in these two versions, following the sequence in which the discourses are located in the Pāli collection.

I.1) The Pāli *Udāna* collection opens with a set of three inspired utterances spoken by the Buddha when, soon after his awakening, he reviewed the law of dependent arising. The Chinese parallel associates its version of these three inspired utterances with the same background narration.[10]

In regard to the remaining inspired utterances found in this first chapter of the Pāli *Udāna* collection, however, the parallel verses that have been identified in the Chinese version are instead accompanied by a word commentary.[11] This is, in fact, a general feature in that regularly

the prose sections in the Chinese version offer merely a word commentary on key expressions found in the inspired utterance in question, without providing a narrative setting for the verses, being thus similar in kind to the Pāli commentary on the *Udāna* collection, the *Udāna-aṭṭhakathā* (Ud-a).

Thus, just to name one example, the report of how the non-Buddhist ascetic Bāhiya Dārucīriya meets the Buddha on the streets of Sāvatthī and receives an enigmatic instruction on the spot that causes his instant full awakening (1.10) is not found at all in the Chinese version,[12] not even in relation to another inspired utterance.[13]

I.2) The second chapter of the Pāli collection introduces its first inspired utterance by describing how the *nāga* king Mucalinda encircles the body of the recently awakened Buddha and spreads its hood over him (2.1), remaining like this for seven days in order to protect the Buddha, who was seated in meditation, from a downpour.[14] The Chinese counterpart describes instead how the recently awakened Buddha approaches the palace of a *nāga* king to deliver the inspired utterance in question, with neither prose nor verse referring to any encircling of the Buddha's body by the *nāga* king or to a downpour.[15] Thus in this case parallel versions of an inspired utterance are accompanied by narrations that share only some elements in common, but differ in other respects.

Another inspired utterance in this chapter of the Pāli version has as its audience a group of mourning lay disciples (2.7), one of whom had lost his only son.[16] According to the Chinese parallel, however, the occasion for this inspired utterance was instead a teaching given by the Buddha to his monk disciples, in which he describes a class of *devas* that pass away from their realm due to excessive merrymaking.[17] Thus in this case the narrations that accompany parallel versions of an inspired utterance differ quite radically from each other.

With the remaining discourses in this chapter of the *Udāna,* the

Chinese text accompanies its version of the respective inspired utterance by a word commentary only.[18] Noteworthy stories like the tale of a wanderer who tries to get oil for his pregnant girl friend and then suffers from having drunk too much of it at a free dispensary (2.6),[19] or the account of how the Buddha's blessing helps Suppavāsā to give birth after seven years of pregnancy (2.8),[20] do not occur at all in the Chinese text.

I.3) The second discourse in the third chapter presents the well-known story of Nanda (3.2), whom the Buddha takes up to heaven in order to show him the heavenly nymphs he will win if he continues to live the life of a monk. The Chinese collection does contain a version of this story, though it relates this to different verses.[21] Most of the other inspired utterances found in the third chapter of the Pāli *Udāna* collection are accompanied in the Chinese parallel by a word commentary, so that the narrative prose that introduces these in the Pāli version remains without a counterpart.[22]

I.4) A discourse in fourth chapter of the Pāli *Udāna* collection records an occasion when the Buddha went to live all alone by himself (4.5), his only company being an elephant that similarly had left his herd in order to be undisturbed. The Chinese version accompanies the corresponding inspired utterance with a similar story.[23]

According to the Pāli version, another inspired utterance in this chapter was spoken by the Buddha on seeing Sāriputta seated in meditation (4.7).[24] The Chinese text instead associates this inspired utterance with the story of Soṇa Koḷivisa who after excessive striving wants to disrobe, is taught the simile of the lute by the Buddha, and eventually becomes an *arahant*.[25] In the case of another tale, according to which a *yakkha* hit Sāriputta on the head when the latter was seated in meditation (4.4), the Chinese parallel only provides a word commentary on the corresponding inspired utterance itself, and the tale of Sāriputta being hit on the head does not occur anywhere in the

Chinese collection.[26]

I.5) The fifth chapter of the Pāli *Udāna* collection contains several remarkable narrations, such as the story of Queen Mallikā (5.1), who with frank honesty tells her husband that she holds nothing dearer than herself;[27] or the tale of the leper Suppabuddha (5.3), who mistakes a congregation that surrounds the Buddha for a food distribution and approaches in the hope of begging something to eat, but instead of receiving food attains stream-entry during the discourse given by the Buddha.[28] Both stories are not found in the Chinese version at all. The same is the case for the account of Soṇa Koṭikanna of Avantī (5.6), a disciple of Mahākaccāna, who after some delay finally goes forth and then visits the Buddha;[29] and for the announcement made by Devadatta in the presence of Ānanda that he will carry out the fortnightly observance (*uposatha*) on his own (5.8).[30]

I.6) The first inspired utterance in the sixth chapter of the Pāli collection revolves around the Buddha's rejection of the volitional formation related to existence (6.1).[31] The Pāli prose introduction to this inspired utterance indicates that the background to the verse in question was that the Buddha had given up of his life force after Ānanda had failed requesting him to live longer. According to the Chinese version's word commentary, however, the implication of this line is that at the time of his awakening the Buddha had rejected any volitional formation in regard to the three realms of existence.[32]

The prose introduction to the next inspired utterance in the Pāli version (6.2) relates how Pasenadi worships spies disguised as ascetics and then, perhaps somewhat tongue in cheek, asks the Buddha about the degree of spiritual development of these ascetics. The narration that accompanies the Chinese version of the inspired utterance in question is instead about a newly ordained monk who finds it difficult to handle the coarse food he gets on his alms round.[33] Another inspired utterance in the Chinese version is, however, accompanied by a similar

narration.[34] The story of how king Pasenadi asks the Buddha's opinion about some fake ascetics also occurs in a discourse in the *Saṃyutta-nikāya* and its parallels in the two *Saṃyukta-āgamas*, which relate it to an inspired utterance that differs from the one associated with this event in the Pāli *Udāna* collection.[35] That is, in this case even a Pāli parallel found in the *Saṃyutta-nikāya* disagrees with the Pāli *Udāna* collection on the relation between a particular event and the verse(s) spoken by the Buddha on that occasion.

The prose narration introducing the ninth inspired utterance in this chapter of the Pāli collection depicts the Buddha seated at night, watching how numbers of moths pass away due to being attracted and then scorched by the lamps that are kept burning (6.9). In the Chinese version, the depiction of moths being scorched recurs, though here this is a simile used in the word commentary to illustrate the implication of the verse.[36] That is, whereas in the Chinese version the image of moths that fly into a flame is an innocent metaphor,[37] in the Pāli account the Buddha keeps watching the passing away of these moths without intervening by putting out the lamps.[38]

I.7) Nine of the ten counterparts to inspired utterances from the seventh chapter of the *Udāna* collection are accompanied in the Chinese version only by a word commentary,[39] so that the great majority of the narrations delivered in the Pāli account are without parallel. In the case of the fifth discourse in the Pāli collection (7.5), which reports how the Buddha eulogizes the monk Lakuṇṭabhaddiya, the parallel verse in the Chinese version does have a narration which, however, involves the tale of a king and thus differs substantially from the Pāli version.[40] A prose passage nearly identical to the Pāli *Udāna* version's description of how the Buddha eulogized the monk Lakuṇṭabhaddiya can be found in the *Saṃyutta-nikāya*, which, however, reports that the Buddha spoke different verses on this occasion.[41] Thus again a Pāli parallel found in the *Saṃyutta-nikāya* disagrees with the Pāli *Udāna* collection on the relationship between a particular narration and the verse(s) the Buddha

spoke in relation to it.

I.8) Several remarkable narrations found in the final chapter of the Pāli *Udāna* collection do not recur at all in the Chinese version, such as the report of how Dabba Mallaputta passed away by rising up into the air and performing a self-cremation (8.9).[42] The same goes for the story of how the Buddha's attendant Nāgasamāla disagrees with the Buddha on which road they should take, leaves the Buddha and thereupon meets with misfortune (8.7), and the tale of Visākhā mourning the death of a grandchild (8.8).[43]

As a narrative background to the fifth inspired utterance of this chapter, the Pāli collection presents the famous account of the Buddha's last meal with Cunda. The parallel verse in the Chinese version is accompanied by a narration that describes how Mahāmoggallāna takes his younger brother up to heaven in order to convince him of the need to be generous.[44] In the case of the sixth discourse in this chapter, however, the Pāli collection and its Chinese counterpart agree that the inspired utterance in question was spoken on an occasion when the Buddha had been invited to a meal by two Brahmins who were fortifying Pāṭaligāma.[45]

In sum, of the narrations that in the Pāli *Udāna* collection provide the background to a particular inspired utterance, only three cases are associated with the parallel verses in the Chinese counterpart. These are the description of the Buddha being seated in meditation soon after his awakening and reviewing dependent arising (1.1-3); the report of how the Buddha goes to live all alone by himself, his only company being an elephant (4.5); and the Buddha being invited to a meal by two Brahmins who are fortifying Pāṭaligāma (8.6). Besides this lack of correspondence in relation to parallel verses, in the great majority of cases narrations found in the Pāli version do not recur in the Chinese version at all, not even in relation to another inspired utterance. Thus a comparative study of the Pāli *Udāna* collection in the light of the only extant

canonical parallel that also has prose narration brings to light that, even though most of the inspired utterances in the Pāli version have a counterpart in the Chinese version, only a small percentage of prose narrations are shared by the two texts.

This indicates that the relationship between an inspired utterance and its prose introduction in the Pāli *Udāna* collection in the majority of cases may not be original. Such a conclusion accords well with the position taken by a range of scholars, mostly based on examining the Pāli *Udāna* collection on its own, who hold that the inspired utterances in this collection seem to present an earlier textual layer, to which in the majority of cases prose narrations appear to have been added only at a later stage. [46]

Ⅱ) Thematic Continuity among Inspired Utterances in the Pāli *Udāna* Collection

Further inspection of the Pāli *Udāna* collection shows that several of the inspired utterances within a chapter are related to one another by sharing a common thematic term.[47] The degree of recurrence of such a thematic term can be seen from the following survey, which lists each occurrence for the eight chapters of the Pāli collection.

II.1) In the first chapter, the term "Brahmin" is present in each inspired utterance and thereby forms the uniting theme for this chapter:

1.1b *brāhmaṇassa*
1.2b *brāhmaṇassa*
1.3b *brāhmaṇassa*
1.4a *brahmaṇo*
1.5d *brāhmaṇā*
1.6d *brāhmaṇan*
1.7b *brāhmaṇo*

1.8d *brāhmaṇan*
1.9 d *brāhmaṇo*
1.10h *brāhmaṇo*

II.2) In the second chapter, the common theme is "happiness", which occurs in nearly all of the inspired utterances:

2.1a *sukho* & 2.1c *sukhaṃ* & 2.1e *sukhā* & 2.1h *sukhan*
2.2a *-sukhaṃ* & 2.2b *sukhaṃ* & 2.2c *-sukhass'*
2.3a *sukha-*[48] & 2.3c *sukham* & 2.3d *sukhaṃ* & 2.3e *sukha-* & 2.3g *sukham* & 2.3h *sukhan*
2.4a *sukha-*
2.5a *sukhaṃ*
2.6a *sukhino*
2.8c *sukhassa*
2.9b *sukhaṃ*
2.10c *sukhiṃ*

II.3) In the third chapter, the thematic term found in each inspired utterance is the "monk":

3.1a *bhikkhuno*
3.2d *bhikkhū*
3.3d *bhikkhū*
3.4c *bhikkhu*
3.5c *bhikkhu*
3.6d *bhikkhū*
3.7a *bhikkhuno*
3.8a *bhikkhuno*
3.9d *bhikkhū*
3.10g *bhikkhuno*

II.4) In the fourth chapter, each inspired utterance mentions the "mind":

4.1d *-citto*
4.2e *-cittassa*
4.3c *cittaṃ*
4.4a *cittaṃ* & 4.4e *cittaṃ*
4.5c *cittaṃ cittena*
4.6e *-citte*
4.7a- *cetaso*
4.8d *-citto*
4.9f *-cittassa*
4.10a *-cittassa*

II.5) In the fifth chapter, several verses refer to "evil":

5.3d *pāpāni*
5.4c *pāpakaṃ*[49] & 5.4e *pāpakaṃ*
5.6c *pāpe* & 5.6d *pāpe*
5.8b *pāpena* &5.8c *pāpaṃ pāpena* & 5.8d *pāpam*

II.6) In the sixth chapter, several verses mention "vision", "views" or "seeing":

6.4d *-dassino*
6.6c *diṭṭhīsu*[50]
6.8 *diṭṭhī*[51]
6.9d *diṭṭhe*
6.10 *-diṭṭhī*[52]

II.7) In the seventh chapter, manifestations of water or things related to water occur in several verses, though the terms vary and only one term appears more than once:

7.1c *oghaṃ*
7.3d *oghaṃ*

II.8) In the eighth chapter, most verses refer in some way to the final goal of liberation, or to those who are liberated, though the terms employed show a range of variations and only one expression occurs more than once:

8.1 *anto dukkhassā*
8.4 *anto dukkhassā*[53)]

As the above survey shows, in the case of the first four chapters the usage of a particular term — *brāhmaṇa, sukha, bhikkhu,* or *citta* — serves as a thematic element present in nearly all inspired utterances within the respective chapter. In the later four chapters, however, a thematic element becomes considerably less prominent. While in the fifth and sixth chapters a particular term still occurs in several instances — *pāpa* and *diṭṭhi/dassana* — the presence of such a thematic term is far less prominent than in the earlier chapters. In the case of the final two chapters, thematic continuity becomes even less discernible.

The chapter headings of the Pāli *Udāna* collection do not reflect these themes, but are usually taken from the first discourse or a significant discourse in the chapter.[54)] This is particularly remarkable in the case of the first four chapters, where the presence of a thematic term is quite prominent. Nevertheless, the titles of these four chapters are *Bodhi-vagga, Mucalinda-vagga*, *Nanda-vagga* and *Meghiya-vagga,* entitled after the Buddha's awakening, the *nāga* king and the two monk protagonists that feature in the first discourse of the respective chapters. Most of the inspired utterances in these four chapters of the Pāli collection find their counterparts in the Sanskrit *Udāna(-varga)* in the *Brāhmaṇa-varga* (33rd chapter), the *Sukha-varga* (30th), the *Bhikṣu-varga* (32nd) and the *Citta-varga* (31st), respectively.[55)]

Notably, whereas the headings of these four chapters in the Pāli *Udāna* collection do not reflect awareness of the theme that underlies their inspired utterances, in the Sanskrit collection the theme that forms

the uniting theme of the inspired utterances collected in a chapter finds explicit expression in that chapter's title. The reason for this could well be that by the time the Pāli *Udāna* collection reached its final state, due to the presence of the prose narrations the themes of the inspired utterances themselves were not sufficiently prominent and therefore had no impact on the title given to the chapters of the collection. In the case of the Sanskrit version, however, due to the absence of prose material the theme that unites the inspired utterances contained in a chapter would have naturally been a characteristic evident enough to influence the naming of that chapter.

Ⅲ) Concatenation between Inspired Utterances in the Pāli *Udāna* Collection

Besides being related to each other by sharing a thematic term, several inspired utterances within a chapter are also related to each other through 'concatenation'. Concatenation involves the repetition of a word (or a closely similar word) from a preceding textual item in order to facilitate recall in proper sequence.[56] As an example for the principle governing such concatenation, we might turn to the fifth discourse of the first chapter (1.5), whose inspired utterance reads:

1.5a *bāhitvā pāpake dhamme,*
1.5b ye *caranti sadā satā,*
1.5c *khīṇasaṃyojanā buddhā,*
1.5d *te ve lokasmiṃ brāhmaṇā'ti*.[57]

The expression *dhamme* in the reference to having discarded evil states in the first line (1.5a) relates to the inspired utterance of the preceding discourse, whose third line reads *dhammena so brahmavādaṃ vadeyya* (1.4c). The present inspired utterance's reference to destroying the fetters, *khīṇasaṃyojanā* (1.5c) shares the expression *khīṇa* with the inspired utterance of the next discourse, which reads *khīṇāsavaṃ*

vantadosaṃ (1.6c). Finally the reference to a *brāhmaṇa* in the last line (1.5d) takes up the word that forms the uniting theme for the entire chapter.

Thus, besides the recurrence of the thematic term *brāhmaṇa,* which is responsible for the present inspired utterance being allocated to the first chapter of the *Udāna*, the location of this inspired utterance as fifth in this chapter is fixed through the principle of concatenation, as it shares a term with the preceding inspired utterance, *dhamme,* and another term with the subsequent inspired utterance, *khīṇa-*. The following survey shows the occurrence of such concatenation between inspired utterances found in adjacent discourses in the *Udāna* collection.[58)]

III.1) Concatenation among inspired utterances in the first chapter of the *Udāna*:

1.1a *yadā have pātubhavanti dhammā* → 1.2a *yadā have pātubhavanti dhammā*
1.1b *ātāpino jhāyato* → 1.2b *ātāpino jhāyato*
1.1c *athassa kaṅkhā vapayanti sabbā* → 1.2 c *athassa kaṅkhā vapayanti sabbā*
1.2a *yadā have pātubhavanti dhammā* → 1.3a *yadā have pātubhavanti dhammā*
1.2b ātāpino jhāyato → 1.3b *ātāpino jhāyato*
1.4d *dhammena* → 1.5a *dhamme*
1.5c *khīṇa-* → 1.6c *khīṇ-*
1.6.a *anaññā* → 1.7a *sakesu*
1.9a *udakena* → 1.10a *āpo*

III.2) Concatenation among inspired utterances in the second chapter:

2.1f *kāmānaṃ* → 2.2a *kāma-*
2.2a *kāma-* → 2.3a & 2.3e *-kāmāni*

2.5c *sakiñcanaṃ passa vihaññamānaṃ* → 2.6c *sakiñcanaṃ passa vihaññamānaṃ*
2.5d *jano janamhi paṭibandha-* → 2.6d *jano janamhi paṭibandha-*[59]
2.7a *piyarūpa-* & 2.7f *piyarūpaṃ* → 2.8b *piyarūpena*

III.3) Concatenation among inspired utterances in the third chapter:

3.2b *kāmakaṇṭako* → 3.3a *kāmakaṇṭako*
3.2d *sukhadukkhesu na vedhati sa* → 3.3d *sukhadukkhesu na vedhati sa*[60]
3.3c *pabbato* → 3.4a & 3.4d *pabbato*
3.4b *suppatiṭṭhito* → 3.5a *upaṭṭhitā*[61]
3.7a *piṇḍapātikassa* → 3.8a *piṇḍapātikassa*
3.7b *attabharassa anaññaposino* → 3.8b *attabharassa anaññaposino*
3.7c *devā pihayanti tādino* → 3.8c *devā pihayanti tādino*

III.4) Concatenation among inspired utterances in the fourth chapter:

4.2b *micchā-* → 4.3c *micchā-*
4.3b verī ... verinaṃ → 4.4d *kopa- ... kuppati*
4.9f *santa-* → 4.10a *upasantasanta-*
4.9g *vikkhīṇo jātisaṃsāro* → 4.10c *vikkhīṇo jātisaṃsāro*

III.5) In the case of the fifth chapter no concatenation is apparent.

III.6) In the sixth chapter concatenation occurs in just a single instance, where the fourth and fifth inspired utterance share part of the verse:

6.4a *imesu kira sajjanti* → 6.5a *imesu kira sajjanti*
6.4b *eke samaṇabrāhmaṇā* → 6.5b *eke samaṇabrāhmaṇā*

III.7) Concatenation in the seventh chapter similarly involves only a single pair of inspired utterances:

7.6c *dhīraṃ* → 7.7c *muniṃ*

7.6e *devā* → 7.7d *sadevako*

III.8) In the case of the eighth chapter, no concatenation appears to occur.

Thus from the perspective of concatenation the same pattern can be discerned as with the thematic term, in that the earlier chapters show a greater degree of concatenation than the later chapters. Now, concatenation would have the effect of facilitating recall in proper sequence only when the textual pieces it connects follow each other immediately. That is, concatenation of the inspired utterances would work only as long as these are memorized on their own, without the intervening prose sections. Thus the existence of concatenation between inspired utterances strongly suggests that at an earlier point of time only these inspired utterances were being memorized on their own. The prose narrations that at present accompany the inspired utterances would have been added only after the sequential structure of these four chapters was already fairly fixed.

While this pattern is quite evident in the case of the first four chapters of the *Udāna* collection, the sixth and seventh chapter show concatenation only for a single twin of inspired utterances in each case, and in the fifth and eighth chapter concatenation seems to be altogether absent. That is, in the case of the final four chapters of the *Udāna* the inspired utterances do not seem to have been held together on their own by concatenation, nor, as shown above, are they interrelated as closely by a thematic term as the earlier four chapters.

Ⅳ) The Sequence of the Discourses in the Pāli *Udāna* Collection

The degree to which in the case of the first four chapters the thematic term of the inspired utterance has played a central role in deciding the location of the discourse can be seen right away with the first four

discourses in the first chapter (1.1-4), which treat of the events soon after the Buddha's awakening. The same is the theme of the first discourse in the second chapter (2.1), which describes how the *nāga* king Mucalinda protects the recently awakened Buddha from rain. While in the *Vinaya* these four discourses follow each other in direct succession,[62] thereby reflecting the temporal sequence of the events they portray, in the *Udāna* collection the Mucalinda tale occurs at a considerable distance from the other three. The reason for this must be that the inspired utterance related to Mucalinda does not contain the word *brahmaṇa* and thus did not fit the pattern that dominates the first chapter, where all inspired utterances contain this word. That is, in this case the connection between the inspired utterances had a stronger influence on the arrangement of the collection than their narrative background.

As in the case of the Mucalinda tale, elsewhere among the first four chapters of the *Udāna* collection similar or closely related prose narrations tend to be separated from each other. Thus the sixth discourse in the first chapter (1.6) and the seventh discourse in the third chapter (3.7) describe how Kassapa goes begging. Again, the second discourse in the second chapter (2.2) and the eighth discourse in the third chapter (3.8) feature monks that are engaged in chattering about trivialities. Another instance involves the third discourse in the second chapter (2.3) and the fourth discourse in the fifth chapter (5.4), which are concerned with children who are harming an animal. In a similar vein, the fourth discourse in the second chapter (2.4), the eighth discourse in the fourth chapter (4.8) and the tenth discourse in the sixth chapter (6.10) share a narration of other recluses that receive less gains than the Buddha and his monks. The same pattern manifests with the seventh discourse in the fourth chapter (4.7) and the tenth discourse in the same chapter (4.10), both of which depict Sāriputta seated in meditation. In each of these cases, it would have been natural to group these discourses together to facilitate recall, had the prose been a determining factor at the time of the shaping of this part of the *Udāna*

collection.

This is, in fact, the case for the later four chapters of the *Udāna,* where similar narrations tend to be grouped together. Thus a nearly identical narration can be found in the fourth (6.4), fifth (6.5) and sixth (6.6) discourses of the sixth chapter. In the seventh chapter the first two discourses (7.1 and 7.2) report Sāriputta instructing the same monk. The third and fourth discourses in the same chapter (7.3 and 7.4) depict the attachment to sensuality of the inhabitants of Sāvatthī in the same terms. The prose of the first four discourses in the eighth chapter (8.1, 8.2, 8.3 and 8.4) is identical, and the last two discourses (8.9 and 8.10) in chapter eight are based on the same event.

Thus, whereas in the earlier four chapters a thematic term is prominent throughout the inspired utterances, concatenation manifests frequently among them and similar prose narrations tend to occur in different sections, in the later four chapters a thematic term shared by the inspired utterances is less evident, concatenation is rare, and similar prose narrations tend to occur together.

These findings point to a gradual development of the *Udāna* collection, where in the case of the earlier four chapters at first only the inspired utterances were assembled, whereas in the case of the later four chapters the inspired utterances would already have been embedded in their respective prose narrations at the time of the formation of these chapters.

Conclusion

The present study thus reveals that the *Udāna* collection appears to have taken shape during oral transmission in a gradual manner. Comparison with its Chinese parallel (T 212) indicates that the inspired utterances may at first have been assembled without the prose

narration that now accompanies them in the Pāli collection.

Yet, whereas the first half of the collection would have come together in its present order when the inspired utterances in question still stood on their own, in the case of the second half of the collection it seems as if the prose narrations were already part of the material that was arranged into chapters. Needless to say, such gradual development does not imply that the inspired utterances in the first four chapters are early and those in the other four chapters are late, since the formation of the *Udāna* collection may at a relatively late stage still have incorporated early material that up to that point had not found its final allocation.

The growth of most of the parallel versions would have been different, in that the *Udāna(-varga)* collection now preserved in Sanskrit etc. appears to be based entirely on assembling ever more inspired utterances, without supplying these with a prose narration or explanation.[63] Perhaps such a prose commentary was also known in the respective reciter traditions, in fact without any explanation or narrative background some of the inspired utterances would be difficult to understand and would also lose much of their effect. Yet, only in the case of one of the *Udāna* collections preserved in Chinese (T 212) did such explanations and narrations become canonical.

The case of the Pāli *Udāna* collection thus appears to be in some respects the reverse of the case of the *Aṭṭhakavagga*. The *Aṭṭhakavagga* in the Pāli canon is entirely in verse,[64] and as such has become part of a greater collection that is predominantly in verse, the *Sutta-nipāta*. The Chinese counterpart to the *Aṭṭhakavagga*, however, presents its verses embedded in a prose narration similar to the material found in the Pāli commentary on the *Sutta-nipāta*. At the same time, the Chinese version has not become part of another collection, but instead stands on its own as a single work.[65] These two cases, the *Udāna* and the *Aṭṭhakavagga*, thus seem to testify to the same type of processes, though the final

products manifest in the Pāli canon in opposite forms.

In sum, then, the process of formation of the Pāli *Udāna* collection appears to have been gradual, involving different types of interaction between verse and prose. In this way, the *Udāna* collection reveals itself as an intriguing product of oral transmission, with all the complexity that this involves.

Abbreviations

AN *Aṅguttara-nikāya*
B^e Burmese edition
C^e Ceylonese edition
DĀ *Dīrgha-āgama* (T 1)
Dhp *Dhammapada*
DN *Dīgha-nikāya*
EĀ *Ekottarika-āgama* (T 125)
E^e PTS edition
Kv *Kathāvatthu*
MĀ *Madhyama-āgama* (T 26)
MN *Majjhima-nikāya*
Paṭis *Paṭisambhidāmagga*
Q Peking edition
S^e Siamese edition
SĀ *Saṃyukta-āgama* (T 99)
$SĀ^2$ 'other' *Saṃyukta-āgama* (T 100)
SHT Sanskrithandschriften aus den Turfanfunden
SN *Saṃyutta-nikāya*
Sn *Sutta-nipāta*
T Taishō edition
Ud *Udāna*
Ud-a *Udāna-aṭṭhakathā*
Vin *Vinaya*

References

Abeynayake, Oliver 1984: *A Textual and Historical Analysis of the Khuddaka Nikāya*, Colombo: Tisara.

An, Yang-Gyu 2006: "Did the Buddha Die of His Last Meal?", *Bukkyō Kenkyū*, vol. 34 pp. 47-62.

Analāyo 2008: "Udāna", in *Encyclopaedia of Buddhism*, W.G. Weeraratne (ed.), Sri Lanka: Department of Buddhist Affairs, vol. 8 no. 2 pp. 375-384.

Bapat, P.V. 1945: "The Arthapada-Sūtra Spoken by the Buddha, First Book (Fascicule)", *Visva-Bharati Annals,* vol. 1 pp. 135-227.

Bapat, P.V. 1950: "The Arthapada-Sūtra Spoken by the Buddha, Second Book (Fascicule)", *Visva-Bharati Annals*, vol. 3 pp. 1-109.

Balk, Michael 1984: *Prajañāvarman's Udānavargavivaraṇa, Transliteration of its Tibetan version*, Bonn: Indica et Tibetica.

Bareau, André 1963: *Recherches sur la Biographie du Buddha dans les Sūtrapiṭaka et le Vinayapiṭaka Anciens: De la Quète de l'Éveil a la Conversion de Śāriputra et de Maudgalyāyana*, Paris: École Française d'Extrême-Orient, vol. 1.

Bareau, André 1968: "La Nourriture Offerte au Buddha lors de son Dernier Repas", in *Mélanges d'Indianisme à la Mémoire de Louis Renou*, Paris: Editions É. de Boccard, pp. 61-71.

Bareau, André 1991: "Les Agissements de Devadatta selon les Chapitres Relatifs au Schisme dans les Divers Vinayapiṭaka", *Bulletin de l'École Française d'Extrême Orient,* vol. 78 pp. 87-132.

Beckh, Hermann 1911: *Udānavarga, Eine Sammlung Buddhistischer Sprüche in Tibetischer Sprache, Nach dem Kanjur und Tanjur mit Anmerkungen Herausgegeben*, Berlin: Reimer.

Bernhard, Franz 1965a: *Udānavarga,* Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, vol. 1.

Bernhard, Franz 1965b: *Udānavarga, Indices, Konkordanzen, Synoptische Tabellen*, Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, vol. 2.

Bernhard, Franz 1969: "Zum Titel des sogenannten 'Udānavarga'", *Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft*, Supplementa I part 3 pp. 872-881.

Bloss, Lowell W. 1973: "The Buddha and the Nāga: A Study in Buddhist Folk Religiosity", *History of Religions*, vol. 13 pp. 36-53.

Chakravarti, N.P. 1930: *L'Udānavarga Sanskrit, Texte Sanscrit en Transcription, avec Traduction et Annotations, Suivi d'une Étude Critique et de Planches,* Paris: Paul Geuthner.

Cowell, E.B. et al. 1886: *The Divyāvadāna, a Collection of Early Buddhist Legends, Now First Edited from the Nepalese Sanskrit Mss. in Cambridge and Paris,* Cambridge: University Press.

de la Vallée Poussin, L. 1912: "Documents Sanscrits de la second Collection M. Stein", *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society*, pp. 355-377.

Dhammajoti, Bhikkhu K.L. 1995: *The Chinese Version of Dharmapada, Translated with introduction and annotations,* Sri Lanka: University of Kelaniya, Postgraduate Institute of Pali and Buddhist Studies.

Dutt, Nalinaksha 1984: *Gilgit Manuscripts, Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinayavastu, vol. III part 2*, Delhi: Sri Satguru.

Gabain, Annemarie von 1954: *Türkische Turfan-Texte VIII*, Berlin: Akademie Verlag.

Geng, Shimin et al. 1988: *Das Zusammentreffen mit Maitreya, Die ersten fünf Kapitel der Hami-Version der Maitrisimit,* Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz.

Gnoli, Raniero 1978: The *Gilgit Manuscript of the Saṅghabhedavastu, Being the 17th and Last Section of the Vinaya of the Mūlasarvāstivādin*, Rome: Istituto Italiano per il Medio ed Estremo Oriente, part 2.

Ireland, John D. 1990: *The Udāna, Inspired Utterances of the Buddha*, Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society.

Jaini Padmanabh S. 1988 (reprinted 2001): "Stages in the Bodhisattva Career of the Tathāgata Maitreya", in *Collected Papers on Buddhist Studies*, ibid. (ed.), Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, pp. 451-500.

Lamotte, Étienne 1958: *Histoire du Bouddhisme Indien, Des Origines ā L'Ère Śaka*, Louvain-la-Neuve: Institut Orientaliste.

Lamotte, Étienne 1968: "Les Yakṣa Ajakalāpaka et Bakkula dans les Écritures Canoniques du Bouddhisme", in *Mélanges d'Indianisme à la Mémoire de Louis Renou*, Paris: Editions É. de Boccard, pp. 445-466.

Lévi, Sylvain 1912: "Documents de l'Asie Centrale; l'Apramāda-varga;

Étude sur les recensions des Dharmapadas", *Journal Asiatique*, ser. 10 vol. 20 pp. 203-294.

Lévi, Sylvain 1915: "Sur la Récitation Primitive des Textes Bouddhiques", *Journal Asiatique*, ser. 11 vol. 5 pp. 401-447.

Lévi, Sylvain 1933: *Fragments de Textes Koutchéens, Udānavarga, Udānastotra, Udānālaṃkāra et Karmavibhaṅga*, Paris: Imprimerie Nationale.

Mizuno Kōgen 1981: 法句経の研究. Tokyo: Shunjūsha.

Mukherjee, Biswadeb 1966: *Die Überlieferung von Devadatta, dem Widersacher des Buddha, in den Kanonischen Schriften*, München: Kitzinger.

Mukherjee, P.K. 1939: "The Dhammapada and the Udānavarga", *Indian Historical Quarterly*, vol. 11 pp. 741-760.

Nakamura, Hajime 1980 (reprinted 1999): *Indian Buddhism, A Survey with Bibliographical Notes*, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.

Nakatani, Hideaki 1984: "Remarques sur la transmission des Dharmapadas", *Bulletin d'Études Indiennes,* vol. 2 pp. 135-151.

Nakatani, Hideaki 1987: *Udānavarga de Subaši, Édition Critique du Manuscrit Sanskrit sur Bois Provenant de Subaši*, Paris: Collége de France, Institut de Civilisation Indienne.

Norman, K.R. 1983: *Pāli Literature, Including the Canonical Literature in Prakrit and Sanskrit of all the Hīnayāna Schools of Buddhism*, Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz.

Pande, Govind Chandra 1957: *Studies in the Origins of Buddhism*, University of Allahabad, Department of Ancient History.

Pachow, W. 1955: *A Comparative Study of the Prātimokṣa, on the Basis of its Chinese, Tibetan, Sanskrit and Pali Versions*, Santiniketan: Sino-Indian Cultural Society.

Pauly, Bernard 1960: "Fragments Sanskrits de Haute Asie (Mission Pelliot)", *Journal Asiatique*, vol. 248 pp. 213-258 and pp. 509-538.

Pauly, Bernard 1961: "Fragments Sanskrits de Haute Asie (Mission Pelliot)", *Journal Asiatique*, vol. 249 pp. 333-410.

Pischel, Richard 1908: "Die Turfan-Recensionen des Dhammapada", in *Sitzungsbericht der Preussischen Akademie der Wissenschaften*, vol. 39 pp. 968-985.

Schmithausen, Lambert 1970: "Zu den Rezensionen des Udānavarga", *Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde Südasiens*, vol. 14 pp. 47-124.

Seidenstücker, Karl 1913: *Über das Udāna*, Leipzig: August Hoffmann.

Seidenstücker, Karl 1920: *Udāna, Das Buch der feierlichen Worte des Erhabenen, Eine kanonische Schrift des Pāli-Buddhismus,* Augsburg: Theodor Lampert.

Sieg, E. et al. 1931: "Udānavarga-Uebersetzungen in 'Kucischer Sprache'", *Bulletin of the School of Oriental Studies*, vol. 6 pp. 483-499.

Sieg, E. et al. 1933: " Bruchstück eines Udānavarga Kommentars (Udānālaṃkāra?) im Tocharischen", in *Festschrift Moriz Winternitz*, O. Stein et al. (ed.), Leipzig: Harrassowitz, pp. 167-173.

Skilling, Peter 1997: *Mahāsūtras: Great Discourses of the Buddha*, Oxford: Pali Text Society, vol. 2.

Takakusu, J. 1966: *A Record of the Buddhist Religion as practised in India and the Malay Archipelago (A. D. 671-695) by I-Tsing*, Delhi: Munshiram Manoharlal.

Thomas, Werner 1971: *Bilinguale Udānavarga-texte der Sammlung Hoernle*, Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner.

Thomas, Werner 1979: "Nachtrag zur Sanskrit-Udānavarga-Ausgabe", *Kuhns Zeitschrift für vergleichende Sprachforschung*, vol. 93 pp. 242-246.

von Hinüber, Oskar 1996 (reprinted 1997): *A Handbook of Pāli Literature*, Delhi: Munshiram Manoharlal.

Waldschmidt, Ernst 1944: *Die Überlieferung vom Lebensende des Buddha, Eine vergleichende Analyse des Mahāparinirvāṇasūtra und seiner Textentsprechungen*, Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, vol. 1.

Waldschmidt, Ernst 1950/vol. 1, 1951/vol. 2: *Das Mahāparinirvāṇasūtra, Text in Sanskrit und Tibetisch, verglichen mit dem Pāli nebst einer Übersetzung der chinesischen Entsprechung im Vinaya der Mūlasarvāstivādins, auf Grund von Turfan-Handschriften herausgegeben und bearbeitet,* Berlin: Akademie Verlag.

Waldschmidt, Ernst 1968: "Ein Beitrag zur Überlieferung vom Sthavira Śroṇa Koṭiviṃśa", in *Mélanges d'Indianisme à la Mémoire de Louis Renou*, Paris: Editions É. de Boccard, pp. 773-787.

Waldschmidt, Ernst et al. 1971: *Sanskrithandschriften aus den Turfanfunden, Teil 3,* Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner.

Waldschmidt, Ernst 1972: "A Contribution to our Knowledge of Sthavira Śroṇa Koṭiviṃśa", in *S.K. De Memorial Volume,* Hazra and Banerji (ed.), Calcutta, pp. 107-116.

Weller, Friedrich 1934: *Brahmajālasūtra, Tibetischer und Mongolischer Text*, Leipzig: Otto Harrassowitz.

Wille, Klaus 2006a: "Some recently identified Sanskrit fragments from the Stein and Hoernle collections in the British Library, London (2)", in *The British Library Sanskrit Fragments*, S. Karashima et al. (ed.), Tokyo: The International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhology, Soka University, vol. 1 pp. 27-64.

Wille, Klaus, 2006b: “The Sanskrit Fragments Or. 15003 in the Hoernle Collection", in *The British Library Sanskrit Fragments,* S. Karashima et al. (ed.), Tokyo: The International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhology, Soka University, vol. 1 pp. 65-153.

Willemen, Charles 1973: "The Prefaces to the Chinese Dharmapadas, Fa-Chü Ching and Ch'u-Yao Ching", *T'oung Pao*, vol. 59 pp. 203-219.

Willemen, Charles 1974: *Dharmapada, a Concordance to Udānavarga, Dhammapada, and the Chinese Dharmapada Literature*, Bruxelles.

Willemen, Charles 1978: *The Chinese Udānavarga, A Collection of Important Odes of the Law, Fa Chi Yao Sung Ching, Translated and Annotated*, Bruxelles: Institut Belge des Hautes Études Chinoises.

Willemen, Charles 1999: *The Scriptural Text: Verses of the Doctrine, with Parables,* Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research.

Winternitz, Moriz 1920 (reprinted 1968): *Geschichte der Indischen Literatur, Band 2, Die Buddhistische Literatur und die Heiligen Texte der Jainas*, Stuttgart: K.F. Koehler.

Woodward, F.L. 1935: *The Minor Anthologies of the Pali Canon, Part II, Udāna: Verses of Uplift and Itivuttaka: As it was said*, London: Oxford University Press.

Xianlin, Ji 1998: *Fragments of the Tocharian A Maitreyasamiti-Nāṭaka of the Xinjiang Museum, China*, Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.

Zongtse, Champa Thupten 1990: *Udānavarga, Band III: Der tibetische Text*, Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.

Notes:

＊ I am indebted to Rod Bucknell, Ken Su and Giuliana Martini for comments on an earlier draft of this article. An extract from the present paper was presented at the 2nd Pāli Symposium organized by the Nan-hua University, Taiwan, 2008.

1） Regarding the title of this collection, Bernhard 1969 suggests that the Sanskrit collection would have had the same title as its Pāli counterpart, i.e. just *Udāna*, without the additional "*-varga*" qualification that is commonly used when referring to the Sanskrit work; cf. also the discussion in Dhammajoti 1995: 39 and Willemen 1978: XXV.

2） Edited by Bernhard 1965a, on this edition cf. esp. Schmithausen 1970. Earlier publication of *Udāna* fragments were by Pischel 1908; de la Vallée Poussin 1912, cf. also the study in Lévi 1912; Chakravarti 1930; Pauly 1960: 213-258 and Pauly 1961: 333-410. Subsequent to Bernard's edition Nakatani 1987 appeared, in addition to which several fragments have been published in the SHT series, Wiesbaden, see SHT VI (1989): 1274, 1293, 1470; SHT VII (1995): 1680, 1715, 1786, 1795; SHT VIII (2000): 1993; SHT IX (2004): 2007, 2039, 2046, 2074R, 2077, 2078, 2079V, 2116, 2129, 2198, 2328c+d, 2483, 2484, 2489, 2496, 2499, 2500, 2505, 2510, 2528, 2547a+b, 2548, 2559, 2561, 2563, 2564, 2574, 2599, 2612, 2642, 2652, 2655, 2675, 2701, 2791, 2796, 2842, 2849, 2851, 2855, 2859, 2863, 2873, 2963, 3013; SHTX (2008) 4119, 4120, 4127, 4149, 4320 and 4357; while fragments from the Stein and Hoernle collections have been published by Wille 2006a and Wille 2006b, with further fragments coming forth in the next volume of *The British Library Sanskrit Fragments*, soon to be published by the International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhology, Soka University.

3） Edited by Beckh 1911 and Zongtse 1990. Prose passages can, however, be found in a commentary on the *Udāna* collection attributed to Prajñāvarman, preserved in Tibetan, which is available in an edition by Balk 1984.

4） 出曜經, T 212 at T 4, 609b-776a, and 法集要頌經, T 213 at T 4, 777a-799c, the latter of which has been translated into English by Willemen 1978. Besides

these two *Udāna* collections, the Chinese canon has also preserved two *Dharmapada* translations: 法句經, T 210 at T 4, 559a-575b, a collection entirely in verse, of which the (probably more original) first twenty-six chapters have been translated into English by Dhammajoti 1995; and 法句譬喩經, T 211 at T 4, 575b-609b, a selection of *Dharmapada* verses combined with prose narrations, which has been translated into English by Willemen 1999. Besides these there exists also an apparently apocryphal work, 佛説法句經, T 2901 at T 85, 1432b-1435c, together with a commentary, 法句經疏, T 2902 at T 85, 1435c-1445a.

5） According to Willemen 1978: XXI, these prose sections are probably "a translation of an Indian text, Dharmatrāta's commentary" (Dharmatrāta is held to have compiled the *Udāna(-varga)*, cf. e.g. the *Mahāvibhāṣa*, T 1545 at T 27, 1b18).

6） T 4, 609c9; cf. also Willemen 1973: 217.

7） Willemen 1978: XXI points out that T 212 sometimes follows a particular inspired utterance with a prose summary of similar stanzas, where the Sanskrit *Udāna(varga)* instead has a whole set of inspired utterances. This may be one of the factors responsible for the differing count of inspired utterances in T 212 and in the Sanskrit version; cf. also the surveys in Mizuno 1981: 62 or Mukherjee 1939: 750 (at this point I also need to mention that, due to my inability to read Japanese, I have unfortunately not been able to make full use of Mizuno's important study, or of other studies published in Japanese).

8） In addition to the versions listed above, several inspired utterances have also been preserved in Tocharian, cf. Lévi 1933: 41-56, Sieg 1931, Thomas 1971 and Thomas 1979; and in Uighur, cf. Gabain 1954: 23-24 and 38-44. Parts of a commentary on the *Udāna*, the *Udānālaṃkāra* attributed to Dharmasoma, are also extant in Tocharian, cf. Lévi 1933: 72-77 and Sieg 1933.

9） My correlation of Pāli *udānas* with their counterparts in T 212 is based on the concordances provided by Bernhard 1965b: 217-263; Mizuno 1981: 394-469 and Willemen 1974.

10） Ud 1.1 at Ud 1,1 and T 212 at T 4, 775c17.

11） The inspired utterances Ud 1.5, 1.7, 1.8, 1.9 and 1.10 have counterparts in T 212 at T 4, 774b17, 775b10, 771a2, 770a10, 735a17 (in the case of Ud 1.5, the

Chinese counterpart only shares the second half of the verse). T 121 accompanies each of the respective verses with a word commentary only. For a comparative study of Ud 1.7 and other parallels cf. Lamotte 1968.

12) Ud 1.10 at Ud 6,25.

13) A case of distantly related narrations can be found in relation to Ud 1.6 at Ud 4,11, which describes how Mahākassapa goes begging among the poor after having been sick, discarding the offer of some *devas* who want to supply him with food. T 212 at T 4, 657b16 reports that after receiving gross food due to his preference for begging at the houses of the poor, Mahākassapa becomes sick and is thereon visited by the Buddha. Though the two narrations thus share the motif of Mahākassapa being sick and both refer to his practice of begging alms, they nevertheless differ considerably and do not seem to be parallel versions of the same event. Besides, the respective inspired utterances are not related to each other. In the case of Ud 1.8 at Ud 5,11, though the narration does not recur at all in T 212, SĀ 1072 at T 2, 278b11 and SĀ^{2} 11 at T 2, 376b21 introduce parallel verses with a similar narration (these parallels have already been noted by Lamotte 1968: 446).

14) Ud 2.1 at Ud 10,6; on this tale cf. also Bareau 1963: 101-105 and Bloss 1973: 49-50.

15) T 212 at T 4, 755b7.

16) Ud 2.7 at Ud 14,21. A tale of a Brahmin who has lost his only son can, however, be found in T 212 at T 4, 649c8, though, besides being related to a different inspired utterance, this tale is rather a parallel to MN 87 at MN II 106,2; MĀ 216 at T 1, 800c22; T 91 at T 1, 915a8 and EĀ 13.3 at T 2, 571b29.

17) T 212 at T 4, 651c19. This description is in several respects similar to a passage found in the *Brahmajāla-sutta* and its parallels, which depicts the *khiddāpadosikā devā,* cf. DN 1 at DN I 19,11, DĀ 21 at T 1, 90c15, and T 21 at T 1, 266c9; *a sūtra* quotation in the *Śāriputrābhidharma*, T 1548 at T 28, 657b12; a Tibetan discourse parallel in Weller 1934: 28,23 (§ 76); and a *sūtra* quotation in Śamathadeva's commentary on the *Abhidharmakośa, Q mngon pa'i bstan bcos, tu* 168a4. This particular type of *devas* features also elsewhere, cf. e.g. DN 24 at DN III 31,5 and its parallel DĀ 15 at T 1, 69b28;

or DN 20 at DN II 260,15, for the parallel versions cf. Skilling 1997: 532 and 548 (§ 23).

18) This is the case for Ud 2.2, 2.3, 2.4, 2.5, 2.6, 2.8, 2.9 and 2.10 and their counterparts in T 212 at T 4, 757a16, 753b1, 758b15, 758a5, 758a16, 652a18, 758a25, and 757c20. In the case of Ud 2.2, the narration recurs in SĀ 413 at T 2, 110a3, though without being related to any verse (this parallel has been noted by Lamotte 1968: 446).

19) Ud 2.6 at Ud 13,20. A distantly related tale about drinking too much oil occurs in the (Mūla-)Sarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, where a monk passes away after drinking a bowlful of ghee, Dutt 1984: 118,10.

20) Ud 2.8 at Ud 15,7.

21) Ud 3.2 at Ud 21,16, and T 212 at T 4, 739c14, whose verse is similar to Dhp 344. A version of the Nanda tale in the *Ekottarika-āgama*, EĀ 18.7 at T 2, 591c5, relates this tale to still other verses (cf. T 2, 591c1, 592b9 and 592c5), while a version in the (Mūla-)sarvāstivāda *Vinaya* has no verses at all, cf. T 1451 at T 24, 252b1.

22) A prose parallelism can be found between Ud 3.8 at Ud 30,18 and T 212 at T 4, 628c27, which report how monks deliberate that on going begging they will be able to get access to pleasant sensory experiences, whereupon they are rebuked by the Buddha. However, this narration introduces different inspired utterances in the two versions. The description in Ud 3.7 at Ud 29,8 of Sakka disguising himself in order to be able to offer alms to Mahākassapa does not occur in T 212 at all (which only has a counterpart to the respective inspired utterance at T 4, 764c13). A similar tale can, however, be found in the Mahīśāsaka *Vinaya*, T 1421 at T 22, 53b16, where it forms the occasion for the Buddha to lay down a rule permitting the acceptance of food offered by gods.

23) Ud 4.5 at Ud 41,6 locates this event at Kosambī and explains that the Buddha wished to retire into solitude because he had been too crowded in by disciples and visitors, *ākiṇṇo viharati bhikkhūhi bhikkhunīhi upāsakehi upāsikāhi ... ākiṇṇo dukkhaṃ na phāsu viharati.* T 212 at T 4, 762c3 instead reports that the monks had been in sore disputation among themselves, to the extent of being unwilling to accept the Buddha's intervention, and it was due to this that he decided to leave them and be on his own. Another

occurrence of this verse in T 212 at T 4, 698a19 is preceded by a reference to the litigating Kosambī monks (T 4, 698a11), thereby confirming that the Buddha's desire for solitude was related to the notorious Kosambī incident, recorded in several discourses and *Vinayas*; cf. MN 128 at MN III 152,24; MĀ 72 at T 1, 532c11; EĀ 24.8 at T 2, 626b12; the Dharmaguptaka *Vinaya*, T 1428 at T 22, 879b24; the Mahāsāṃghika *Vinaya*, T 1425 at T 22, 333c27; the Mahīśāsaka *Vinaya*, T 1421 at T 22, 158c7; the (Mūla-)Sarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, Dutt 1984: 176,3; and the Theravāda *Vinaya,* Vin I 337,2.

24) Ud 4.7 at Ud 43,10.

25) T 212 at T 4, 638c2; with counterparts in AN 6.55 at AN III 374,10 (=Vin I 182,5), MĀ 123 at T 1, 612a2; SĀ 254 at T 2, 62b24; EĀ 23.3 at T 2, 612a22; in the Dharmaguptaka *Vinaya*, T 1428 at T 22, 844b7; in the Mahīśāsaka *Vinaya*, T 1421 at T 22, 146a22; and in the (Mūla-)Sarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, Gnoli 1978: 142,9; cf. also Waldschmidt 1968 and Waldschmidt 1972.

26) Ud 4.4 at Ud 39,18 and T 212 at T 4, 763b25. The same tale is, however, found in the two extant *Saṃyukta-āgama* translations as well as in the *Ekottarika-āgama*, SĀ 1330 at T 2, 367b5; SĀ^{2} 329 at T 2, 485a24 and EĀ 48.6 at T 2, 793a13, cf. also Lamotte 1968: 446.

27) Ud 5.1 at Ud 47,2, where only the verse finds a parallel in T 212 at T 4, 653b6.

28) Ud 5.3 at Ud 48,17, the verse parallel occurs in T 212 at T 4, 743c29.

29) Ud 5.6 at Ud 57,2 (= Vin I 194,18), with its verse parallel in T 212 at T 4, 742b23; for a study of the parallel versions cf. Lévi 1915.

30) Ud 5.8 at Ud 60,15, where the verse has a counterpart in T 212 at T 4, 744c11. An account of Devadatta's activities can be found in T 212 at T 4, 695c18-696c11, without, however, any reference to an announcement made by Devadatta to Ānanda regarding his schismatic intentions. For comparative studies of the events surrounding Devadatta cf. Bareau 1991 and Mukherjee 1966.

31) Ud 6.1 at Ud 64,29: *bhavasaṅkhāram avassajji muni* (B^{e} reads *avassaji*).

32) T 212 at T 4, 735c6: "attaining true and supreme awakening ... [he] forsook the three realms and did not generate formations [in regard to them]", 至真等正覺 ... 捨其三有不造其行.

33) Ud 6.2 at Ud 65,2 and T 212 at T 4, 690b23. T 212 at T 4, 691b13 then

continues by linking this event to several other stories, among them also the attempt by the Buddha's foster mother to offer a robe to the Buddha, paralleling the account given in the *Dakkhiṇavibhaṅga-sutta* and its parallels, cf. MN 142 at MN III 253,10; MĀ 180 at T 1, 721c28 ; T 84 at T 1, 903c4; T 202 at T 4, 434a6; T 203 at T 4, 470a15; T 1421 at T 22, 185b21; SHT III 979 in Waldschmidt 1971: 241; a Tocharian version in Xianlin 1998: 168, and an Uighur version in Geng 1988: 192, for further parallels cf. Jaini 1988: 461 and Lamotte 1958: 779.

34) T 212 at T 4, 748c5, with the difference that here Pasenadi only finds out that the ascetics are fake after he has asked the Buddha about them.

35) SN 3.2 at SN I 79,16; SĀ 1148 at T 2, 306a13 and SĀ^{2} 71 at T 2, 399b18, cf. also Lamotte 1968: 446.

36) Ud 6.9 at Ud 72,6 and T 212 at T 4, 748a26: 如蛾投火不顧後慮.

37) A similar pattern can be observed in relation to an inspired utterance found in Ud 7.9 at Ud 79,5: *kiṃ kayirā udapānena, āpā ce sabbadā siyuṃ? taṇhāya mūlato chetvā, kissa pariyesanaṃ care?* "What is the use of a well, if water is there all the time? Having cut craving at its root, what would one go about searching for?" While T 212 at T 4, 707c20 accompanies its version of this verse with a word commentary that draws out the implication of the metaphor, the Pāli version takes the reference to the well literally and narrates a miracle that happened when once the Brahmins of a particular village blocked a well with chaff in order to prevent the Buddhist monks from drinking the water. When the Buddha requested Ānanda to fetch him some water from that well, it miraculously threw up all the chaff by itself and became filled to the brim with clean water. Pande 1957: 75 comments that "the author of the prose ... seems to have grossly misunderstood the final verse, which intends 'water' in no more than a merely figurative sense". A recurrence of this verse in the *Divyāvadāna,* Cowell 1886: 56,12, is related to the Buddha crossing the Ganges river and thus also seems to take it in a literal sense.

38) This is to some extent surprising in view of the importance accorded to avoiding harming other living beings among ancient Indian wanderers and recluses, something also reflected in *Vinaya* rules that, for example, prohibit using water that contains living beings. The respective *pācittiya/pātayantika*

rules, which proscribe pouring out or using water that contains living beings, can be found in the Dharmaguptaka *Vinaya*, T 1428 at T 22, 646c18 and 677c2; in the Kāśyapīya *Vinaya*, T 1460 at T 24, 662b19 and c21; in the Mahīśāsaka *Vinaya*, T 1421 at T 22, 45a6 (as Pachow 1955: 143 points out, the Mahīśāsaka *Vinaya* has this regulation as a single rule); in the Mahāsāṃghika *Vinaya*, T 1425 at T 22, 345a14 and 372c23; in the (Mūla-)Sarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, T 1442 at T 23, 789b21 and 828c5; in the Sarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, T 1435 at T 23, 79c15 and 97b18; and in the Theravāda *Vinaya* at Vin IV 49,3 and Vin IV 125,20. A description of how this observance was carried out in seventh century India can be found in Yì-jìng's (義淨) travel records, T 2125 at T 54, 208a13, translated in Takakusu 1966: 30. In view of the concern with not harming even minute living beings, reflected in these regulations, one would perhaps rather expect a Buddha to have more compassion for the insects that keep flying into the flame, instead of just coming out with an inspired utterance on seeing their predicament.

39) This is the case for Ud 7.1, 7.2, 7.3, 7.4, 7.6, 7.7, 7.8, 7,9, 7.10. and their counterparts in T 212 at T 4, 739a21, 734a8, 739a7, 632c28, 752a28, 752b7, 699a9, 707c18, 737a14. In the case of Ud 7.7 there is nevertheless a parallelism, as the Pāli version's prose at Ud 77,12 describes the Buddha seated in meditation, something also recorded in the Chinese version, T 212 at T 4, 752b12: 如來坐禪寂然入定.

40) Ud 7.5 at Ud 76,10 and T 212 at T 4, 740b4. The verse found in Ud 7.5 is quoted in SN 41.5 at SN IV 291,19 and its parallel SĀ 566 at T 2, 149b8.

41) SN 21:6 at SN II 279,12; cf. also SĀ 1063 at T 2, 276b11 and SĀ^{2} 2 at T 2, 374b4.

42) Ud 8.9 at Ud 92,25 and again Ud 8.10 at Ud 93,18, where the respective verses have counterparts in T 212 at T 4, 734b11 and T 4, 757c1. A version of Dabba's spectacular passing away can be found in SĀ 1076 at T 2, 280b25 and SĀ^{2} 15 at T 2, 378a28, cf. also Lamotte 1968: 447, according to which he even performed the twin miracle. This report exemplifies a general pattern, in that while according to the Theravāda tradition the performance of the twin miracle is the sole domain of the Buddha, cf. Paṭis I 125,2: *tathāgato yamakapāṭihīraṃ karoti asādhāraṇaṃ sāvakehi*, other Buddhist

schools took a more liberal position, e.g. the *Divyāvadāna*, Cowell 161,13, explicitly attributes the ability to perform the twin miracle to disciples, *sarvaśrāvakasādhāraṇā*, cf. in more detail Skilling 1997: 306.

43) Ud 8.7 at Ud 90,16 and Ud 8.8 at Ud 91,13, where only the inspired utterances have a counterpart in T 212 at T 4, 742b5 and T 4, 650c1. A narration that has some elements in common with Ud 8.7 can be found in T 212 at T 4, 730a21, according to which the Buddha is on a road in the company of a monk and tells the latter that they should take a by-road to avoid Devadatta. The monk then inquires if the Buddha is afraid, which leads to an exposition by the Buddha on his aloofness from any fear. Besides differing substantially from the narration given in Ud 8.7, this tale is also related to a different inspired utterance.

44) Ud 8.5 at Ud 81,11, where the respective inspired utterance at Ud 88,21 has a counterpart in T 212 at T 4, 741c13. For comparative studies of the Buddha's last meal cf. e.g. An 2006, Bareau 1968 and Waldschmidt 1944: 141ff.

45) Ud 8.6 at Ud 85,24 and T 212 at T 4, 707c4. A noteworthy difference between the two versions is that the Chinese account does not report any prediction made by the Buddha regarding the future of Pāṭaligāma. According to Ud 8.6 at Ud 88,27 the Buddha predicted: *Pāṭaliputtassa ... tayo antarāyā bhavissanti - aggito vā udakato vā mithubhedato* (notably this prediction changes from the earlier used Pāṭaligāma, also employed in the title to this chapter of the *Udāna*, to Pāṭaliputta). This prediction recurs also in DN 16 at DN II 88,1 and in Vin I 229,11, which lists the three dangers as *aggito vā udakato vā abbhantarato vā mithubhedā* (cf. also Kv 314,6, which quotes this passage in support of the possibility of predicting the future); with a similar reading found in fragment S 360 162 V4 in Waldschmidt 1950: 12: *agnito-py-udakato-(py-a)[bhya]nta[ra]to-pi [m]i[th]obh[edāt].* The three causes recur in the discourse parallels to DN 16, DĀ 2 at T 1, 12c10: 一者大水, 二者大火, 三者中人與外人謀, T 5 at T 1, 162c17: 一者大火, 二者大水, 三者中人與外人謀; and T 6 at T 1, 177c28: 一者大火, 二者大水, 三者中人與外人謀. While the Tibetan version of the (Mūla-)Sarvāstivāda *Vinaya* similarly lists three causes, Waldschmidt 1951: 149: *me dang chu dang nang 'khrug gis so;* the Chinese version, T 1448 at T 24, 22b12, mentions only two causes, water

and fire, 水火. In relation to DN 16, Pande 1957: 102 comments that this prophecy "could hardly have been added much before the Village of Pāṭaligā ma actually attained such eminence as to become the capital of Magadha".

46) On this topic cf. Abeynayake 1984: 66; Ireland 1990: 7; Lamotte 1968: 465; Nakamura 1980: 43; Norman 1983: 61; Pande 1957: 72; Seidenstücker 1920: XVI; von Hinüber 1996: 46; Winternitz 1920: 67; Woodward 1935: V.

47) This characteristic was first noticed by Seidenstücker 1913: 93.

48) In this particular case, I adjusted the count of verse parts in accordance with the Asian editions, as the first part of this inspired utterance (*sukhakāmāni bhūtāni*) is missing in E^{e}, which thus does not have the first instance of *sukha-*, as a result of which the other instances occur at 2.3b, 2.3c, 2.3d, 2.3f and 2.3g respectively. Here and elsewhere, some obvious misprints in E^{e} have not been taken into account as variant readings.

49) I have adjusted the count of verse parts, as the first part of this inspired utterance (*sace bhāyatha dukkhassa*) is missing in E^{e}, which thus has *pāpakaṃ* at 5.4b and d.

50) C^{e} reads *diṭṭhisu*.

51) This inspired utterance is not in verse, *diṭṭhī* is found at Ud 72,1; B^{e} and C^{e} read *diṭṭhiṃ*.

52) This inspired utterance is not in verse, *-diṭṭhī* is found at Ud 73,13; C^{e} reads *diṭṭhi*.

53) Both instances are not in verse, *anto dukkhassā* is in each case found in the last line.

54) An exception to this pattern could be *Cūla-vagga* (7), where the chapter title might reflect the relative shortness of the chapter, though alternatively it might also be a referent to the protagonist of its first two discourses, a monk of particularly small size.

55) The *Brāhmaṇa-varga* has counterparts to the Pāli *udānas* 1.1; 1.2; 1.3; 1.4; 1.5; 1.6; 1.7; 1.8; 1.9. The *Sukha-varga* has counterparts to 2.1; 2.2; 2.3; 2.4; 2.5; 2.6; 2.9; 2.10. The *Bhikṣu-varga* has counterparts to 3.1; 3.2; 3.3; 3.4; 3.7; 3.8; 3.9; and 3.10. The *Citta-varga* has counterparts to 4.1; 4.2; 4.3; 4.4; 4.5; and 4.6; cf. also the survey in Mizuno 1981: 8-10.

56) I already drew attention to the existence of concatenation in the *Udāna* in Anālayo 2008; on concatenation in *pātimokkha* rules cf. von Hinüber 1996:

12.

57) Ud 4,8; B^e and S^e read *lokasmi*.

58) My survey only takes into account cases where concatenation can be found between inspired utterances in discourses that follow each other, thereby not covering cases where similar phrases occur at a distance, such as e.g. 3.6b *amamo nirāso* → *amamo nirāso* 3.9c.

59) B^e and C^e read in both instances *jano janasmiṃ*, a reading found only in the second instance in S^e; C^e moreover reads *paṭibaddha-*.

60) B^e and S^e read *vedhatī*.

61) S^e reads *supatiṭṭhito*.

62) Vin I 1-3.

63) This process thus incorporated verses that in the Pāli tradition are allocated to the *Dhammapada*; cf. also Bernhard 1969: 881, Nakatani 1984: 139 and von Hinüber 1996: 45.

64) Sn 766-975.

65) T 198 at T 4, 174b-189c; for a study and translation of this work cf. Bapat 1945 and 1950.